

**INTERCULTURAL CITIES** BUILDING BRIDGES, BREAKING WALLS





Intercultural Competence Development: Introducing and Engaging Diversity Globally

**Project Impact Analysis** 



#### Contributors:

Dr. Kseniya Rubicondo – Intercultural Institute Ashburn-Europe, Luxembourg Prof. Liudmyla Afanasieva – Director of the Center for Sociological Studies of Bogdan Khmelnitsky Melitopol State Pedagogical University (MSPU) Ms. Iryna Bukrieieva – Senior Researcher at the Centre for Sociological Studies, MSPU Ms. Natalia Hlebova – Senior Researcher at the Centre for Sociological Studies, MSPU Ms. Liudmyla Glyns'ka – Senior Researcher at the Centre for Sociological Studies, MSPU

# Table of Contents

| Table of Contents                                    | 3   |
|--|-----|
| Introduction and Methodology                         | 4   |
| Impact on Intercultural Experience and Communication | 8   |
| Impact on Intercultural Knowledge                    | 155 |
| Impact on Intercultural Relations                    | 188 |
| Impact on Intercultural Skills Development           | 21  |
| Impact on the Degree of Intercultural Awareness      | 223 |
| Impact on the Target Groups of the Project           | 26  |
| Conclusions and Recommendations                      | 31  |

#### Introduction

This document offers an impact analysis of the intercity cooperation project "Introducing and Engaging Diversity Globally" (IEDG) implemented by the intercultural partner cities Melitopol (Ukraine) and Ballarat (Australia) with the support of the Intercultural Cities Programme of the Council of Europe in July - November 2020.

Overall, the project aimed to contribute to the advancement of intercultural (ICC) competence skills of city administrators, police, media, minority and religious groups representatives, internally displaced persons and other residents of the partner cities by offering a series of workshops conducted by local trainers who were formed through a series of online ICC competence seminars – or "trainings for trainers" - offered by an international ICC expert. The "Introducing and Engaging Diversity Globally" project also sought to devise and deliver applicable intercultural competence tools for local trainers and to carry out an impact assessment of the action to ensure added value creation for the participating cities and the global ICC community in general.

As part of the project, six webinars (or 'trainings for trainers') on intercultural competence were conducted by an intercultural expert in two languages for the pool of nearly 100 participants in ICC cities. The webinars were carried out using the on-line platform Zoom in the form of interactive sessions that introduced key intercultural competence concepts, tools and approaches. A training manual was produced as a result of the on-line webinars and delivered to the local trainers in participating cities. Subsequently, a series of local trainings on intercultural competence were organised in the member cities of and Australasian and Ukrainian national ICC Networks for various target groups. The choice of target groups was determined by the residents of the cities through a preliminary questionnaire in June 2020 which involved more than 500 participants.

In order to perform an impact analysis of the project, the Center for Sociological Studies of Bohdan Khmelnytskyi Melitopol State Pedagogical University (MSPU), in collaboration with an international ICC expert carried out an ex-ante (before on-line webinars) mapping of intercultural competence skills and ex-post evaluation (after the series of local trainings) survey in the cities-members of Ukrainian Network of Intercultural Cities – Melitopol, Lutsk, Odessa, Pavlograd, Vinnytsia, Sumy – and in Australian cities of Ballarat, Adelaida, Bacchus-Marsh, Maribirnong, Melbourne and Melton. Relevant indicators were designed and comparative analysis of the 2-wave survey results was carried out to evaluate the impact and effectiveness of the project.

# Methodology

More precisely, two sociological surveys (ex-ante and ex-post) were carried out to monitor the new knowledge and ICC competence skills transfer, to make sure that new opportunities for interaction are created for people from different cultural backgrounds, to ensure best practice exchange between local authorities and other agencies, to provide for the creation of local and international partnerships, and to evaluate the impact of the project on the development of ICC competence skills for city administrators, police officers, media representatives, national minorities and youth.

The impact of the project was studied from the perspective of five main categories comprising the intercultural competence approach - interaction and communication practices, intercultural knowledge, intercultural relations, intercultural skills development, degree of intercultural awareness - and in relation to the different target groups of the project.

# Ex-ante survey toolbox

*Figure 1. Gender Distribution: Ex-ante Survey* 

*Survey content:* The survey consisted of 26 questions divided into 5 sections, the content of which matched the specific survey tasks. It was conducted in July 2020 using the Google Forms platform.<sup>1</sup>

*Survey sample*. The survey was attended by 521 respondents. The distribution of respondents by gender is as follows: 85.9% female and 13.3% male, 0.8% preferred not to answer this question. The gender distribution for the countries is as follows: women - Ukraine 85.7%, Australia - 88.5% of respondents; men - Ukraine 13.4% and Australia - 11.5% (see Figure 1 below).



The respondents represented the following age groups: 16-22 (14.3%), 23-29 (10.5%), 30-39 (21.8%), 40-49 (26.1%), 50-59 (19.0%), 60 and older (8.3%) (Figure 2).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup><u>https://docs.google.com/forms/d/1Npxvv3Ghl32AKSTBAGEgheVhUUVywzUvMiOGnP0WJrc/closedform</u>





A few largest groups of respondents were identified during the first wave of the survey (see Figure 3 below). These groups included educators, civil servants (including police officers), managers of enterprises, structural units, organisations, students, representatives of minorities, NGOs and the media.





The sample is nonrepeatable (provided by fixing the respondent's IP address at the time of the online session), stochastic. The sample error is no more than 4.3%, the confidence interval is 95%. The survey data were processed in IBM SPSS Statistics 21 and Microsoft Office Excel programs, content analysis method was applied for open questions.

#### Ex-post survey toolbox

*Survey content:* The survey content cross-referred to the ex-ante survey in order to allow for comparison of the results and consisted of 23 questions.

*Survey sample*: 211 respondents took part in the survey representing ICC competence training participants from six Ukrainian and six Australian intercultural cities: Melitopol, Lutsk, Odessa, Pavlograd, Vinnytsia, Sumy (Ukraine) and Ballarat, Adelaida, Bacchus-Marsh, Maribirnong, Melbourne and Melton (Australia)<sup>2</sup>.

It is should be mentioned that local ICC competence trainings were held in October 2020 in Ukrainian ICC cities, and in November 2020 in Australia. Training announcement together with the registration form were published on the official websites of the partner cities and in social networks in September 2020. The choice of target audiences was determined by the results of the first (ex-ante) survey. Hence, the project target groups were as follows (Figure 4):

- 1. civil servants (city administrators, social workers) 24,1%;
- 2. students 20,3%;
- 3. representatives of national minority and religious groups 17.3%;
- 4. police officers, journalists and internally displaced persons 16.9%;
- 5. educators 8.0%;
- 6. youth (youth movements representatives, young teachers) 4.2%



# Figure 4. Target groups

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>https://docs.google.com/forms/d/1gTIPdmqnwSYbls5GkBFV5v9ZuKluT\_L3A18t8ulZwY4/viewform?ts=5f7f4911&edit\_requested=true

Impact on Intercultural Experience and Communication

The process of developing intercultural competence starts with the recognition and acceptance of culturally specific patterns of behaviour, which are often expressed in people's responses to real life situations based on their intercultural experience, knowledge, attitudes and self-awareness.

One of the early findings of the first (ex-ante) survey of the project was that in the system of intercultural interactions of Ukrainian participants, their behavioural patterns formed two main groups around the constructs of: *communication* (based on empathy, close acceptance of the other, sensitivity and openness) and *ethics* (rules, tolerance, certain conservative attitudes) (Figure 5).





At the same time, their Australian counterparts perceive the same behavioural patterns as clearly separated from each other and assign them their own, independent value fields of almost equal importance. For the Australian respondents, communication is primarily about ethics and rules, and ICC competence echoes with empathy. (Figure 6).



Figure 6. Perception of self in own culture

These perceptions are formed both in the working environment and in daily life. 27.7% of all survey participants in both countries confirmed that they had had an *intercultural experience* at work or at their place of study. As a result of this experience, only 9.0% of the respondents "learned to think differently". Yet, 19.8% agreed that they had "enriched themselves culturally", 22.2% confirmed that this experience had "a positive impact on their professional life" and 33.5% had "become more competent in interpersonal relationships" as a result. (Figure 7).





The analysis of the project impact shows that participation in the ICC competence trainings helped participants to reveal and appreciate the multidimensional nature of intercultural interactions and/or relations. In the ex-post survey, they provided broader and more informed answers when analysing their intercultural experiences, far beyond the list of behavioural patterns identified by the initial ICC competence mapping survey. For example, 99.2% of respondents *experience of intercultural interaction* in their work/study places acknowledged in the post-training survey that they learned "to listen without judging in order to understand the values and beliefs of people from different cultures, as they are," 95.8% felt that "the knowledge acquired during the training is valuable and applicable to daily work and life situations in an intercultural environment".

The local trainings also helped this category of respondents to analyse their own behaviour from the point of view of intercultural competence. More than 97% of them "objectively assessed their level of intercultural competence", 98% said that they " better understood cultural differences". 98% of survey respondents admitted that the training made them reflect on "how their own values, beliefs and actions affect their behaviour".

More than 95% of the survey respondents admitted that training "changed the way I see the world", 97.0% said they realised that their "actions and ways of communicating can influence other people".96% of respondents also agreed that ICC competence trainings helped them to better understand "what people from different backgrounds/cultures think or feel", as their interest in learning about similarities and differences between people of different cultures and backgrounds arouse (99%). 95% of survey participants reported that the ICC competence project experience as a whole prompted them to "establish or improve relationships with people from different cultures and backgrounds".

96% of respondents also acknowledged that the ICC competence training helped them to better understand "what people from different cultures/backgrounds think or feel", as they became interested in learning more about the similarities and differences between different cultures (99%). 95% of the survey participants said that the experience of the ICC competence project as a whole have prompted them to "establish or improve relationships with people from different cultures and backgrounds" (Figure 8).



# Figure 8. Impact of Individual Intercultural Experience

Naturally, inhabitants of intercultural cities around the world interact with people from different cultures in their daily lives. An analysis of Australian and Ukrainian ICC cities from this perspective identified four main groups in which such interactions occur. 43% of the survey participants have **friends** from different cultures, 40% of them interact in their daily life with culturally diverse **city residents**, representatives of different cultures are part of their **families** for more than 30% of the respondents, and almost 30% of them have **colleagues** with different cultural background (Figure 9).

Therefore, in addition to a clear reflection of the interculturality of the urban environments of the cities participating in the project, this study highlights the significant complexity and density of intercultural interactions in ICC cities in general.





It is noteworthy that out of 40% of respondents who have experience of intercultural interaction with their city residents, 99% affirmed that they will use the skills and knowledge gained during the training in their daily interactions.

The analysis of the survey also shows that interest to discovering and learning about different cultures emerged among the respondents who did not have intercultural interaction or communication experience prior to the training. This group is rather small (nearly 50 people), but almost everybody (99%) within this group agreed that the ICC competence training 'awakened' their interest in learning about similarities and differences between different cultures.

In the first survey, respondents were asked to identify the channels of intercultural interaction outside their workplace (Figure 10).





It was determined that for young Ukrainians (36.4%) and Australian respondents of all categories (86.7%), the most popular channels for intercultural interaction outside the workplace were Facebook/Instagram and the telephone (25.1% and 63.2% respectively). It is interesting to note that after the training, 95% of this group thought more about "what people from other cultures think or feel" and about " how I see the world".

Next valuable conclusion from the project impact analysis, is that residents of both Ukrainian and Australian cities believe that attending public events and joint celebrations with representatives of different cultures (from time to time to communicate in public space 50.6%, attendance of public events 45.4%, joint celebrations 29.8%) have a more significant impact on the formation of intercultural competence.

Another important finding of the project's impact analysis is that residents of Ukrainian and Australian cities believe that **participation in public events** and **joint celebrations** with representatives of different cultures have a significant impact on the formation of intercultural competence. 50.6% of them agree that it is important to communicate occasionally in the public space; 45.4% emphasise the importance of participation in public events, and 29.8% insist on joint celebrations (Figure 11).



#### Figure 11. Participation in public events and joint celebrations

Moreover, *public spaces and social events* are also regarded as the most effective spaces for intercultural interaction and for shaping and practicing intercultural competence. This opinion was significantly supported by minority representatives (49%), representatives of religious groups and confessions (64%), educators (32%), students (25%), and the media (25%).

Nevertheless, it was found that only 17.6% of civil servants - from the structural units responsible for citywide social activities - are actively involved in these events. The good news is that many of them attended local ICC competence trainings and following this experience 98% of them agreed that they developed the ability to "listen without judging" realizing that their "own values, beliefs and actions can influence others". An equal number of them said they felt the need to "objectively estimate their level of intercultural competence". For 93% of civil servants who are not responsible for intercultural activities in the cities, training was instrumental in establishing or improving relations with people from different cultural backgrounds (Figure 12).



# Figure 12. Impact of trainings on ICC competence skills

#### Impact on Intercultural Knowledge

Intercultural competence requires a whole range of skills essential for effective and productive interaction and exchange and for the establishment of positive and respectful relationships in a multicultural urban space. In the evaluation surveys, an attempt was made to determine the respondents' degree of intercultural knowledge on the basis of direct and indirect questions which were quantified to form cumulative scores varying from 1 to 4 (Figure 13). Furthermore, they were factored to form five main categories of intercultural knowledge indicators in order to allow comparison of data. These indicators include *reflexivity, positionality, proactivity, affectivity, and cognition.* Their ratings were compared between the first and second waves od the impact evaluation surveys of the project.



Figure 13. Five Categories of Intercultural Knowledge

The analysis of the data showed that, in general, the respondents' intercultural knowledge was above average prior to the training. It was also observed that among police officers, migrants, displaced persons, doctors, students and minority representatives - the level of this knowledge was higher than among civil servants, NGOs and representatives of different religious confessions. This once reinforced the timeliness of the project and the importance of its priorities, namely, outreach to city administrators and community target groups.

**Reflexivity** generally refers to examining one's own beliefs, assumptions and actions, and reflecting on how these may influence our behaviour, or essentially, what we do with the knowledge of beliefs, judgments and actions. In the ex-ante survey (before training), the average reflexivity rating of respondents was estimated at 2.79. Among police officers, migrants/IDPs, medical professionals, students and minority representatives, the level of knowledge was higher (2.90) than among the military, civil servants, representatives of public organisations and various religious confessions (2.40). After the training, the average level of reflexivity increased across all categories of participants and reached 3.54.

**Affectivity** is an ability to experience feelings, emotions, judgement, motivations, etc. It might be remembered that the kinds of affectivities evoked in us, such as fear and gratitude, also depend partly on how we envision and interpret the objects in question. The average affectivity rating in the ex-ante survey was **2.61**. School teachers, instructors, IDPs, migrants and migrants scored higher on this criteria (2.70) than police and military officers, medical workers, students, members of religious confessions and journalists (2.30). After the training, the average level of affectivity reached **3.53**.

**Proactivity** or proactive behaviour describes self-initiated efforts to solve an issue before it occurs. Proactive behaviour refers to acting in anticipation of a future situation, rather than reacting. The average proactivity rating in the ex-ante survey was 2.71. Migrants, police officers, journalists and representatives of religious groups scored higher (2.83) than military personnel, medical workers, IDPs, and managers of different organizations (2.67) in the pre-training survey. Following the local ICC competence training, the average level of proactivity increased 3.53.

**Positionality** is a social and political context that shapes one's identity in terms of class, gender, race, sexuality, ability status and others. It describes how your identity affects your understanding and outlook. The average rating of positionality in the ex-ante survey was 2.8. In the pre-training survey, police officers, migrants, representatives of public organisations and ethnic communities, journalists achieved higher positionality scores (2.9) than military personnel, doctors, students, civil servants, IDPs and representatives of religious confessions (2.7). Following the local ICC competence training, the average level of proactivity improved to 3.59.

**Cognition** refers to mental processes associated with acquiring knowledge and understanding. These processes include thinking, knowing, remembering, judging, problem solving and others. The average cognition rating of survey participants in the ex-ante survey was estimated at 2.56. In the pre-training survey, migrants, minority representatives, journalists, and educators scored higher on this criterion (2.68). Police, military, medical workers, representatives of religious groups and public organisations demonstrated lower level of cognition according to the pre-training survey (2.40). After the training, the average level of cognition increased to 3.48.

As a result of the series of ICC competence trainings, a positive shift has been observed in the degree of intercultural knowledge of the participants, as well as in all individual categories that comprise this measure. See the summary of the post-training survey results, Figure 14 below.

The majority of the respondents agreed that the trainings helped to "better understand the differences with other cultures" - 3.59; "generated curiosity and interest in learning about similarities and differences between people with different cultural backgrounds" - 3.66; "helped to better understand how people of different cultures/origins may think or feel" - 3.43; "helped to establish or improve relationships with people of different origins/cultures" - 3.4.





The analysis of the project impact revealed that the training participants obtained valuable information and helpful practical methods on how to overcome inter-cultural barriers in real-life situations and to build community trust and solidarity, which conforms to the expectations of the project.

#### Impact on Intercultural Relations

While intercultural knowledge is regarded as one of the fundamentals for establishing intercultural interactions, intercultural relations themselves represent a specific type of social relations that reflects people's behaviour in terms of their identification with different cultural/ethnic groups and their role in public life.

As a part of this project, an impact of the of the ICC competence trainings on the development of intercultural relations was also examined. This was accomplished on the basis of direct and indirect questions which were quantified to form cumulative scores varying from 1 to 4 (Figure 15). Furthermore, they were factored to form five key categories of intercultural relations indicators in order to allow comparison of data. These indicators include **interest, interaction**, **perception**, **decisiveness and adaptation**. Their ratings were compared between the first and second impact evaluation surveys of the project.



#### Figure 15. Degree of Intercultural Relations

The overall rating of **interest** as a necessity-based attitude or motivational state of an individual, inducing cognitive activity was 3.21 in the ex-ante survey. Moreover, migrants/residents, medical professionals, police officers, and representatives of public organisations had a higher rating of 3.36 than students, heads of enterprises, organisations, institutions and structural units, military personnel, teachers/teachers, representatives of religious confessions and minorities, whose rating was 3.14. After the training, this rating increased to 3.66.

According to the post-training survey, almost 86% of representatives of public and 90.0% of youth organisations, 97% of students and all civil servants, military personnel, police officers, IDPs, representatives of religious and ethnic communities, and educators agreed that these sessions helped them to better understand the commonalities and differences between the present in their cities cultures.

The average rating of **interaction** - regarded here as a desire to meet and cognitively interpenetrate diverse cultures, relying on connections and communication with their representatives - before the training was 3.20. Students, IDPs, representatives of minority and religious groups, public organisations achieved the rating of 3.28, while civil servants, military personnel, police officers, managers of enterprises, organisations, institutions and structural units achieved of 3.16. After the training, the overall rating increased to 3.40.

The average rating of **perception** as a process of information interpretation through the prism of own values, believes, culture in the ex-ante was 3.14. Migrants, IDPs, police, medical and public organisations representatives demonstrated a higher rating of 3.28, while civil servants, journalists, educators, students and representatives of religious confessions showed a lower rating of 2.96. After the training, the rating has raised to 3.43.

This is supported by the fact that trainings helped 86% of representatives of public and 90% of youth organisations, 91% of civil servants, 93% of students, 98% of minorities and religious groups, 95% of police and military officers to realise that "people from diverse cultures may think or feel very differently in different situations". 50% of representatives of public organisations, 89% of educators, 93% of students and youth, 95% of civil servants, 97% minority and religious groups, and all police and military officers agreed that the tools and approaches shared within the training helped "to establish or improve relations with people from different cultures.

The average rating of **decisiveness** as an ability of an individual to make responsible decisions independently and in a timely manner and to implement them persistently in a social environment was 3.09 before training. This rating was 3.18 for migrants and IDPs, medical professionals and police officers, while journalists, military personnel, representatives of religious confessions, enterprise managers, heads of structural subdivisions, and students achieved the average 2.88. After the training, the overall rating increased to 3.54.

The average rating of **adaptation** as a positive attitude towards another culture, based on appreciation of its norms and values, ability to live and act according to its rules while maintaining one's own cultural identity was 2.99 before the training.

This rating was slightly higher for IDPs and migrants, medical representatives, police officers and journalists - 3.12, while for representatives of public organisations, civil servants, military personnel, representatives of religious and minority groups, enterprise managers, heads of structural subdivisions, and students the rating was 2.85. After the training, the average rating increased to 3.53.

In general, the average rating for five key categories in **intercultural relations** category was estimated at 3.13 before the training. After the training, the rating of the category increased to 3.51. (Figure 16).



Figure16. Degree of Intercultural Relations After Training

It can therefore be concluded that the tools and approaches provided within the ICC competence trainings opened new opportunities for participants for improving their interpersonal understanding and interaction with people from different cultural backgrounds.

#### Impact on Intercultural Skills Development

Intercultural relations are always acquired and consolidated in practice. In this way, people develop social and personal *skills* of intercultural competence, which will enable them to choose strategies and tactics for constructive dialogue in the process of communication, and to improve the effectiveness of intercultural communication.

In order to analyse the degree of intercultural skills development, the respondents were asked to answer relevant direct and indirect questions which were quantified to form cumulative scores varying from 1 to 4 (Figure 17). Their answers were then factored to form four main categories of indicators which included **motivation**, **sensitivity**, **flexibility**, **and cooperativeness**. Their ratings were compared between the first and second impact evaluation surveys of the project.



#### Figure 17. Intercultural skills

The average rating of **sensitivity** as a process of progressive learning about a different culture with an emphasis on the sensual perception of cultural differences was 3.17 before training. At the same time, police officers, doctors, representatives of public organisations, enterprise and organisations' managers, heads of structural units and journalists had a slightly higher pre-training rating of 3.3, while students, representatives of religious confessions and minorities, and military personnel had a lower rating of 2.93. After the training, the average rating increased to 3.70.

It is noteworthy that 88% of students, 90% of youth, 93% of NGOs, 95% of minority and religious groups representatives, 97% of civil servants and all policemen and military personnel agreed that the knowledge gained during the training is valuable for their work and everyday life.

**Motivation** is a process that triggers, guides and sustains purposeful behaviour. It involves biological, emotional, social and cognitive processes that activate behaviour. The average rating for motivation in the ex-ante survey was 3.18. It was slightly higher 3.26 for minority, religious groups and NGO representatives, civil servants and journalists than for military, police, educators, enterprise and other managers and heads of structural subdivisions - 3.10. After the training sessions, the rating increased to 3.55.

The average rating of **flexibility** as readiness for change, ability to adapt own behaviour according to changing conditions of work or life, to be open to different points of views and opinions and to find solutions in changing conditions was 3.14 before training. This figure was slightly higher for IDPs, migrants, representatives of religious confessions and NGOs and journalists 3.28, while for civil servants, medical workers, military personnel, enterprises and other organisations' managers, heads of structural subdivisions, minority representatives and students it was lower - 2.99. Following the ICC competence training, the overall rating for this indicator increased to 3.43.

**Cooperativeness** is generally understood as a cooperative effort, hence it is regarded here as an effort of working together to achieve common objectives or results and helping each other on the way. The average rating for cooperativeness before the training was 3.03. This figure was slightly higher - 3.18 – for IDPs, migrants, police officers, educators, public servants, NGO representatives, while for students, enterprise and other organisations' managers, heads of structural subdivisions, representatives of minority and religious groups, medical workers and military personnel it was 2.89. After the training, the rating went up to 3.54.

According to the ex-ante survey data analysis, the average degree of the participants' intercultural skills was 3.13 before the training. It increased considerably reaching 3.55 (Figure 18) after the training implementation, improving by this the overall ICC competence of the participants.



# Figure 18. Intercultural skills

#### Impact on the Degree of Intercultural Awareness

For an intercultural city, developing intercultural awareness is particularly important, as it is one of the foundations for intercultural competence skills development. Not surprisingly, this category is the most complex in this study and includes the largest number - 10 - of individual indicators, which were constructed using a similar approach to the creation of indicators in other sections of this report.

These indicators are: **perception of self, attitude, agreement, prejudice, self-awareness, identity, friendliness, self-perception by others, self-development,** and **negative reaction** (Figure 19). The degrees of intercultural awareness of the participants were compared between the first and second impact evaluation surveys of the project to track any possible change or improvement,



#### Figure 19. Intercultural Awareness

The average rating for **self-perception by others** indicator regarded here as a sense or image of oneself that comprises the views of others and awareness of oneself in relation to others was 3.20 in the pre-training survey. For police officers, journalists, NGO representatives it was higher 3.32 than for enterprise and other organisations' managers, heads of structural subdivisions, minority and religious confessions representatives, students, military and medical personnel - 2.78. After the training, this indicator increased to 3.66.

The rating of **self-development** - as a process of comprehensive personal growth, which is manifested through independent learning and the application of this knowledge in practice - was 2.99 before training. Police, journalists, NGO, ethnic and religious groups representatives had a slightly higher value - 3.28 - than civil servants, military and medical personnel, enterprise and other organisations' managers, heads of structural subdivisions, students - 2.8. After the training, the overall rating of the participants increased to 3.43.

The initial average rating of **perception of self** indicator, regarded by this study as the mental image one has of oneself based on the interpretation of the meaning of one's own behaviours, attitudes and preferences was 2.98. Students, employers and other organisations' managers, heads of structural subdivisions, representatives of ethnic groups and religious denominations, civil servants, and military personnel had a lower rating 2.82, while IDPs, migrants, educators, police, NGO representatives, and journalists scored higher 3.20. After the training, the rating increased to 3.47.

The rating of **attitude** as an indicator of the way we think, feel or behave towards someone or something often based on our previous experience with or predisposition with different culture was estimated at 2.92 before training. Representatives of minority and religious groups and police officers had a higher rating of 3.18. Students, enterprises and other organisations' managers, heads of structural subdivisions, military personnel, journalists, civil servants ranked at 2.78. After the training, the overall rating **increased considerably** and reached 3.53.

**Self-awareness** is regarded here as a way an individual consciously acknowledges and understands his or her own character, feelings, motives and desires in the context of intercultural relations. Awareness rating of the survey respondents was estimated at 2.89 in the pre-training survey; it increased to 3.40 in the post-training evaluation. Among migrants and police officers this rating was slightly higher 3.12 than among students, enterprises and other organisations' managers, heads of subdivisions, NGO, minority and religious groups representatives, IDPs and military personnel - 2.74.

**Prejudice** is generally understood as a preconceived judgment or opinion or as an adverse leaning formed without just grounds or before sufficient knowledge.<sup>3</sup> This study obviously deals with prejudices in the context of intercultural interaction. The average rating for this indicator in the pre-training survey was 2.88.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> <u>https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/prejudice</u>

Among migrants, representatives of religious confessions, police officers and journalists have it was higher - 3.15 - than among NGO representatives, military personnel, medical workers, IDPs, students, enterprises and other organisations' managers, heads of structural subdivisions and minority representatives - 2.71. After the training, the overall rating rose to 3.72.

Participants' capacity to offset **negative reactions or experiences** related to cultural diversity (e.g. fear, mockery, repulsion, oppression, etc.) was measured by a relevant indicator the rating of which was 2.55 before training and improved considerably after the training – 3.55. This is one of the indicators that report the most significant impact of the project. It is noteworthy that police officers, ICC trainees, students, enterprise and other organisations' managers, heads of subdivisions had a higher rating of 2.71 in the pre-training survey than the representatives of minorities and religious confessions, migrants, medical workers, military personnel, journalists, civil servants and NGO representatives - 2.39.

Overall, this study identified a positive change in the degree of Intercultural Awareness of the project participants, as its average rating increased from 2.89 to 3.55 (Figures 19 and 20).



#### Figure 20. Intercultural Awareness

#### Impact on the Target Groups of the Project

ICC competence project participants represented different organisations, cities, countries, different cultures and even different continents. Naturally, the degree of their intercultural exposure, experience and competence also varied. Consequently, in addition to quantitative estimations provided in the previous sections of this report, qualitative analysis of the project impact was carried out across its target groups using written notes or interviews of training participants.

This analysis has identified some common features among the target groups of the project. For example, for **civil servants, office and social workers, administrators and teachers, the** key motives for participating in *the* training were to *acquire new applicable knowledge in order to improve their intercultural interactions*. These motives coincide in both Ukrainian and Australian respondents. They include, among others, the desire "to improve the quality of ICC competence knowledge and understand how to implement it at work on daily basis", 'to fight stereotypes", "to ensure more competent participation in the monitoring group for the implementation of intercultural strategy of the city", "to improve the level of intercultural competence in medicine", "to understand all the complex aspects of the topic," "to learn how to exchange with representatives of various cultures in the most efficient way", "to learn how I can consciously build confidence when interacting with people from different cultures".

**Media representatives, bloggers and journalists** stated broader expectations from the project mainly in the realm of self-development. In particular they emphasized "personal development as a young journalist"; "broadening the scope of professional knowledge"; "getting to know other cultures"; "understanding what interculturality is, which segments of the population are concerned and what the role of a journalist can be", "learning more about new initiatives in the city, and about city residents' attitude towards interculturality".

The expectations **of policemen and military representatives** were to "learn and experience something new", "to join face-to-face debate on an actual topic, share my thoughts"; "to better understand the concept of interculturality and its practical application "; "learn more about the cultural diversity of our city".

The representatives **national minorities and religious confessions, internally displaced people, migrants, NGO representatives the key defined their motivation** for participation in the training as *both cognitive and social, related to various intercultural experiences.* This is particularly true **for NGO and minority representatives** "desire to get to know representatives of other nationalities and their cultural characteristics"; "general development, application in public work". The IDPs were eager to learn more about topical issues of their city, as well as about how to improve their interaction with other people. For **Ukrainian and Australian students, the** main criteria for motivation to participate in trainings were *curiosity, acquiring intercultural communication skills and learning something new represented key motivations for the university students*. They were interested in "learning about how to communicate on this topic with your peers", "to learn about commonalities and differences between certain cultures", as some of them came from mixed families, "to be able to better understand different religions, e.g. Hinduism and Orthodoxy", "to become more interculturally aware", and "to see where my culture is positioned in relation to others."

Obviously, it was a challenging task for the project to satisfy this varied palette of expectations in one or two training sessions within one months period. Nevertheless, many participants admitted that they the project completely or very much satisfied their expectations. Please see the breakdown of satisfaction of the project participants expectations in the table below



#### Figure 21. Meeting the expectations of the project's target groups

Another very positive finding of the project analysis is that 99% of participants agreed that they will use the skills and knowledge acquired during the training both in their professional and in everyday life. This includes 93% of NGO and civil society representatives, 98% of civil servants, and all police officers, military personnel, IDPs, minority and religious groups representatives, youth organisations, and educators (Figure 22).



# Figure 22. Potential use of knowledge and skills acquired during the training

Australian public officials and city administrators confirmed that they will use the project proposed model and tools in their work, in future thematic discussions, and make use of Story Circles methodology.

Australian educators confirmed that they will "work to introduce more minority representatives to joint activities", and that the project helped them to develop more confidence in communicating with people from different cultures. Australian **police officers** are ready "to better listen while communicating with people from different cultures", "to consider separate situations in their context trying to understand how this may affect people", "to be more careful in preparing advertising materials to make sure that information can be easily understood by people from different cultures".

The participants also provided feedback regarding the methodology of the project. The majority of them - regardless of their profession - underlined the practical relevance and effectiveness of the interactive tools and methods used during the training, namely the Story Circles approach, self-reflection, open discussion, interactive exercise and teamwork.

At the same time, some variations were also observed in the participants' feedback across the target groups. For civil servants, social workers, administrators, teachers and healthcare professionals, for example the most valuable were *participatory approach* and the *use of innovative methods to improve ICC competence*, namely: "innovativeness, closeness to everyday realities"; "interactive learning, communication between all participants during the training"; "well-defined concepts"; "skilful combination of theory and practice"; "bringing different target audiences into a single group, which allowed for an open and frank dialogue"; "touching upon sensitive issues, such as LGDP".

**Representatives of national minorities and religious confessions** appreciated the most "an interactive form of work in which representatives of different cultures could practice in-depth

thinking, share common values and better understand each other", "interesting cognitive activities, thanks to which all participants felt free and comfortable", "the training provides an opportunity for deep thinking".

**Police and military officers** stressed the "value exploratory" aspect of the training, namely "understanding the impact of human values, their diversity and representation", as well as "the role cultural values and self-perception play in individual behaviour and interactions".

NGO, media and youth representatives appreciated the project presented approaches to overcoming barriers between different cultures, an opportunity to reflect on their own cultural values and believes as well as those of other cultures, to share personal stories and experience during the training, the transmitted conviction that " we can all cooperate despite our nationality and faith". "Storytelling and assistance helped me to understand how I could repeat this practice to improve intercultural competence in my own organisation" noted one of them. Australian students enjoyed 'group discussion', 'reaching a wider audience' and learning about 'interesting intercultural theories'.

In order to further improve intercultural competence in their communities, the participants suggested that intercultural competence trainings should be made regular (systematic) and that future trainers pay more attention to "flexible skills", such as the ability to think critically and creatively, analyse problems and generate solutions, communicate and build relationships effectively, prevent and constructively resolve intercultural conflicts, manage and control stress.

In particular, Ukrainian civil servants, administrators and social workers believe that it is necessary to "make training sessions regular", "to talk more about overcoming stereotypes of interculturality," "to draw attention to religious issues in the media". Australian city officials suggested to have "more examples of different situations", "extended training time to gain a deeper understanding of the concept", and Australian public officers and students suggested that, due to the limited time available for trainings within the current project, they would like to participate in subsequent training sessions on "intercultural interaction and experience sharing" in order "to gain a deeper understanding of the essence of interculturality". Participants from Ukraine suggested to organise intercity webinars on intercultural competence in order to ensure more opportunities for communication and understanding of their respective urban settings.

**Media representatives** expressed the need for a specific tailor-made ICC competence training for journalists, in order to better understand "international canons" for media narratives, develop some practical skills to address situational challenges.

Welcoming environments, excellent organisation of training sessions, and practical and positive attitude of the trainers were appreciated by the participants.

Besides, training participants from Melitopol proposed the following summary table, which enumerates their identified obstacles to the establishment of intercultural dialogue and solidarity in their community and offers relevant solutions to address them (Table 1).

# Table 1. Ideas and proposals for improving intercultural competenceBARRIERSSOLUTIONS

| BARRIERS SOLUTIONS   |        |   |
|--|--------|---|
| A reluctance to cooperate from different cultures  |        | Involve as many people as possible in intercultural activities  |
| Lack of tolerance and understanding between different cultures, religions, and ethnicities   |        | Organisation of events (cultural and educational) for representatives of different cultures   |
| Use of intercultural events for personal promotion   |        | Development and implementation of<br>intercultural competence programme<br>for the city   |
| Conducting meetings and training<br>sessions with a "warm" audience of<br>people who are interested in the topic<br>and are ready to change their attitude |        | Empowerment and educational<br>events, organisation of communities<br>for the development of<br>interculturality                                      |
| towards people from other cultures.  | AW     | Involvement of communication professionals  |
| Insufficient understanding of<br>interculturality by an ordinary resident  | $\sim$ | Examining an issue and developing a clear algorithm for solving it  |
| Luck of involvement and intercultural vision among city deputies, departments reps, misanthropists   |        | Conducting explanatory work for all city population and cultures  |
| Improvement is needed in the area of consideration of cultural needs of the population   |        | Involve children and youth in city<br>events and introduce them to the<br>traditions of other nations through<br>games                                |
| Attitude, behaviour of each individual in relation to interculturality   |        | In case of a city-level event,<br>installation of cultural facilities and<br>monuments, seek opinions of<br>culturally diverse community<br>residents |
| Incompetence of citizens and representatives of organisations that deal with intercultural issues  |        | More informal events with representatives of cultures (for those  |
| Inexperience<br>Reluctance to recognize differences<br>between different cultures  | 2      | who are genuinely interested, joint hobbies, sports events).  |

# Conclusions and Recommendations

The current study of the impact of the project "Introducing and Engaging Diversity Globally" implemented by the intercultural partner cities Melitopol (Ukraine) and Ballarat (Australia) with the support of the ICC Programme of the Council of Europe in July - November 2020, reiterated once again the importance of people's perceptions, their psychological readiness to accept and appreciate diverse cultures, identities and values for the success of intercultural relations and interactions in general. One of its key findings is that ICC competence development requires a comprehensive and systematic approach regardless the type of target audience. This is because intercultural competence is a complex set of individual capacities, knowledge, attitudes and skills that individuals consciously develop over time aiming to perform appropriately in intercultural environment.

The current project has been able to produce a number of positive outcomes, outputs and impacts despite its very short implementation period of four months. One of the most significant outcomes of the "Introducing and Engaging Diversity Globally" project is the delivery of up to 20 local training sessions on ICC competence for a range of target groups in the participating cities, which followed a series of six webinars (or "training of trainers") conducted by an intercultural expert in two languages for a pool of almost 100 participants.

In addition, a noticeable improvement in intercultural competence was estimated among city administrators, young people, educators, police officers, minority representatives and the media. A considerable shift towards a positive perception of cultural differences was identified, as well as an increased interest in learning about a different cultures and in cooperating with people from different cultural backgrounds. Participation in ICC competence training also helped participants to analyse their intercultural experiences in the framework of intercultural competence, to learn more about their own culture, to reconsider or improve their perception of diversity, appreciate its advantage, to broaden their competences and experiences in intercultural interaction and to abandon some of the existing unjustified myths and stereotypes.

For example, comparative analysis of the selection of impact indicators in the 'intercultural knowledge' category (see relevant section of this report) - intercultural reflexivity, positionality, proactivity, affectivity, cognition – helped to distil the "points of growth" in the direction of intercultural competence development among training participants. In particular, it demonstrated that local intercultural competence trainings have resulted in increased openness of the participants to acquiring more knowledge about both their own and different from their own cultures; a considerable shift toward positive perception of cultural differences was identified, along with increased desire for cooperation between people from different cultures.

The analysis of Intercultural Relations category comprising intercultural interest, interaction, perception, decisiveness and adaptation indicators helped to track positive change in the participants' behaviour in terms of their attempts to adequately perceive and interpret different

cultural values, to consciously overcome cultural boundaries, to develop empathy to other cultures, and to see not only differences but also commonalities between them.

The ex-ante and ex-post analysis of the degree of intercultural skills of the participant - indicators of intercultural motivation, sensitivity, flexibility, and cooperativeness – helped to trigger the impact of the current project in terms of increased flexibility, i.e. desire of training participants to exit one's own comfort zone and discover the unknown, to broaden their intercultural interaction skills and experiences, to reconsider or positively change their perception of diversity, and to broaden their competences and experiences in intercultural interaction.

Analysis of the impact on the degree of self-awareness, i.e. set of indicators on perception by others, attitude, self-awareness, prejudice and negative reaction, etc. - revealed the fact that many training participants developed deeper understanding of their own culture while interacting with others during the trainings. This helped them to better identify similarities and differences between cultures, to evaluate their existing ethnocultural perceptions and experiences in the framework of ICC competence, and to draw adequate conclusions.

Moreover, according to the participants, ICC competence trainings provided within the project helped to gradually increase personal and professional intercultural competence through a stepby-step approach, starting from self-evaluation, diversity awareness, attitude shaping, reflection on specific intercultural situations, and then developing an ability to cumulatively apply the acquired during the training knowledge and skills in order to overcome cultural barriers in everyday life and work situations, to establish intercultural dialogue and ensure mutual understanding.

Besides enabling impact analysis of the current project, the abovementioned sets of indicators can be used for systematic monitoring of the state of affairs and trends in the development of intercultural competence of individuals and groups, communities and organisations; they can also help to evaluate the degree of intercultural competence or communication in citiesmembers of the ICC Programme of the Council of Europe. Hence, in addition to the positive impact of the project on the development of the intercultural competence of its participants, the project-designed sets of categories and indicators also represent useful outcome and an added-value for the ICC Global.

Along with the growing degree of intercultural competence of training participants, more local issues and questions have been identified by them as a result of this project implementation. Participants have provided a number of valuable suggestions, opinions and feedback that were taken into account in the project-produced recommendations.

For instance, the participants highlighted the need for combatting stereotypes and prejudices towards cultural, ethnic, racial, religious and other groups in their communities, the benefits of which could go as far as to improving security, developing respectful relations between and within the communities, fighting discriminatory expressions and fake news. Police officers expressed a particular interest in acquiring more intercultural competence skills for dealing with

racial discrimination and sexual discrimination, against LGBT in particular; representatives of religious organisations and national minorities expressed their desire to participate in larger scale trainings that would bring together different social groups in an interactive environment, where practical intercultural issues can be debated with a broader audience. Media representatives were eager to learn more about key approaches and practices in creating anti-discrimination narratives, especially in "hot spots", and about methods to timely identify and counterbalance fake news and false statements.

Local trainers, in their turn, suggested to make the intercultural competence trainings a regular practice in order to further focus on practical skills development aiming at prevention and constructive resolution of intercultural conflicts, cross-cultural tension management, identification of interculturally competent solutions, effective communication and intercultural relationships building.

It was also highlighted that intercultural competence skills development is particularly important for the cities during the pandemic and the resulting economic, and in many cases, political and social crises. In the post-Covid environment, there has been an increase in inequalities, often leading to a simplified or biased perception of cultures and diversity. "Standard", interculturally incompetent approaches to integration, if applied in urban environments, may trigger ethnic and cultural segregation, poverty, exclusion or conflict. In such situations, ICC competence approach is essential as it promotes mutual understanding, value acceptance and bonding, encourages intercultural communication and positive interaction, and creates an atmosphere of trust and empowerment within communities and organisations to jointly overcome common challenges.

This study also demonstrated that there is a need to further diversify intercultural activities in project participating cities in the cities-members of both Australian and Ukrainian networks, to attract more international intercultural experts, to promote the benefits of intercultural policy approach, to bring up social and legal issues of equality, inclusiveness and discrimination more often, to scale-up the ICC competence training experiences and to run an information campaign promoting anti-discrimination and anti-rumour policies in the media and social networks.